- Very divisive issue (different paradigms have different requirements)
- Cognitivist:
 - there is no need for embodiment (cf. physical symbol system hypothesis)
 - Cognitivism exhibits a form of mind-body dualism [Thelen & Smith 94, Thelen 95]
 - Symbolic knowledge can be programmed in directly
 - Embodiment may be useful, but it's not necessary

- Emergent:
 - Must be embodied (by definition)
 - Embedded in their environment
 - Situated historical developmental context
 - Three complementary processes
 - Self-organization
 - Structural coupling
 - Development
 - Without physical embodied exploration, a cognitive system has no basis for development
 - Embodiment is a key component of system dynamics

- Are there different forms of embodiment?
- What's an action?
- Does it have to be forcible?



- Is speech an act (or action)?
- Does action require mobility?
- Is a computer triggering a switch embodied?



Instantiation Realization Embedded Situated Embodied In context

Different or the same?



From: T. Ziemke, 'What's this thing called embodiment?', 2003

Copyright © 2010 David Vernon (www.vernon.eu)

- Structural coupling
 - System can be perturbed by the environment
 - System can perturb the environment
- Historical embodiment
 - History of structural coupling
- Physical embodiment
 - Forcible action (excluded software agents)
- Organismoid embodiment
 - Organism-like bodily form (e.g. humanoid robots)
- Organismic embodiment
 - Autopoietic living systems

- Structural Coupling
 - The system-environment perturbations must be
 - rich enough to drive the ontogenic development
 - But not destructive of the self-organization
 - No guarantee that the resultant cognitive behaviour will be consistent with human preconceptions
 - Shared epistemology (knowledge) requires shared experiences

The problem of disparate embodiment & interaction histories



The problem of disparate embodiment & interaction histories



- Hollnagel uses the term 'cognition in context' (for embodied or situated cognition)
- 'Cognition without context' ... cognitivist approaches
- 5 characteristics of situated cognition
 - 1. Cognition is not confined to a single individual ... can be distributed across multiple natural and artificial systems
 - 1. Cognitive activity is not confined to instantaneous responses/action ... it's part of a stream of activity
 - 2. Social cognitive systems are embedded in an environment that constrains their activities and provides resources
 - 3. Activities are not static but evolve and undergo transitions
 - 4. Almost all activity is aided by something/someone outside the cognitive entity (e.g. a tool)

Embodiment Cognitivist vs. Emergent



<u>Functionalist</u>: Mechanisms are independent of the instantiation

<u>Dualist:</u>

Distinction between mind and body



Embodiment plays a constitutive role in the process of cognition

Not just a vehicle for instantiation

[Freeman and Nunez] Copyright © 2010 David Vernon (www.vernon.eu)